

Response to MAC consultation on the Shortage Occupation List

4 January 2019



**Creative.
Industries.
Federation.**

Contents:

About this submission

1. Skills gaps in the creative industries
2. An immigration system that tackles skills shortages
3. Existing industry-led initiatives

Annex 1: Overview of survey results

Annex 2: Additional data collected

About this submission

The **Creative Industries Federation** is the national organisation for the UK's creative industries, cultural education and arts, representing members in every sub-sector across all nations and regions. We are therefore in a unique position to understand the breadth of skills shortages faced by the sector and to advocate their needs.

The creative industries are one of the most valuable sectors to the UK economy with a contribution of £101.5bn to GVA in 2017, larger than the automotive, life sciences, aerospace and oil and gas industries combined. They account for one in nine UK businesses and employ more than two million people. 12.7% of all jobs in the creative industries are held by international workers and 55% of these by EU nationals.¹

In this submission, we highlight the need for an updated shortage occupation list which reflects the needs of the creative industries. The sector faces significant domestic and international skills shortages, and any changes must be coupled with changes to the salary threshold and scrapping the immigration skills charge.

In Annex 1, you will find the results of the latest Federation survey on the Tier 2 visa system. The survey closed on 2nd January 2019 and collected 103 responses from creative industries employers across the UK.

We also engaged in an extensive consultation with the sector and published our Global Talent Report in October 2017. You can find the report attached which outlines further recommendations.

For further details regarding any aspect of this response, please contact **Caroline Julian, Director of Policy and Public Affairs** at caroline@creativeindustriesfederation.com or on 020 3771 0350.

¹ "DCMS Sectors Economic Estimates 2017: Employment." DCMS, July 2018

The government announced in its immigration white paper, published in December 2018, its intention to introduce a single immigration system covering all nationalities and sectors, and focused on skills. This includes maintaining the Tier 2 salary threshold of £30,000 and applying it to EEA hires post-Brexit. The government has also commissioned the Migration Advisory Committee (MAC) to review the shortage occupation list, which is the focus of this consultation response.

There is a clear need to expand and update the shortage occupation list. It is essential that the list keeps pace with UK skills shortages and properly reflects the needs of our sector. It should give employers as much flexibility as possible over recruitment. This should be combined with an expansion and regular review of the standard occupational classification codes and ‘appropriate rates’, to improve the UK’s ability to track the working needs of the creative industries.

Below you will find an overview of the skills shortages and challenges faced by the sector, as well as recommendations on the shortage occupation list. These recommendations must be combined with reforms to the salary threshold and the scrapping of the immigration skills charge, alongside more effective support for companies’ training programmes and backing for creative subjects in education, if skills shortages and the challenges faced by the sector are to be addressed.²

Given the strong levels of growth and potential growth within the creative industries (81% of creative enterprises expect to grow in the next three years³), it is fundamental that we ensure our creative industries have access to the full breadth of talent that they require. Access to international talent promotes growth, leading to the creation of more jobs in the economy as well as the development of the domestic workforce by bringing them into contact with the best and brightest in the world.

Skills gaps in the creative industries

Respondents to our recent survey (see Annex 1) cited a number of challenges which make it difficult for them to recruit for certain roles. These include a lack of funding, the financial and administrative burden of the current immigration system, and increased competition for talent in their market. Several respondents have also witnessed a decline in applicants recently, particularly from abroad.

They also identified a number of challenges related to both the domestic and global workforce. Respondents highlighted the lack of domestic skills due to limited training opportunities in the UK and many graduates leaving university underprepared for how the creative industries actually work. Respondents also highlighted that there are global skills gaps which cannot be addressed by upskilling the domestic workforce and which will always exist. Creative enterprises often recruit for specialist roles, particularly when working in small niche markets or with new digital technologies, where the pool of global talent is incredibly small.

These skills shortages create significant challenges for creative enterprises. A lack of domestic skills means they will often have no choice but to look abroad which introduces immigration charges, visa costs, additional

² We also support the immigration white paper’s proposal to expand the Tier 2 route to medium skilled workers, to scrap the Tier 2 cap and resident labour market test, and to streamline the visa process. This should be combined with a streamlined sponsorship application process to reduce paperwork and measures to make it easier for international talent to move between employers.

³ “Growing the UK’s Creative Industries”, Creative Industries Federation, 2018

advertising spend, and hiring (or training) staff with knowledge of immigration policy. An inability to fill crucial roles also delays projects, slows down business development, makes creative enterprises less agile and, overall, inhibits the growth of the sector.

These issues will only get worse once we leave the EU and no longer have free movement of talent. As indicated in a 2017 Federation survey, conducted with over 250 creative enterprises for our Global Talent Report: 75% of creative enterprises currently employ EU nationals and two-thirds believed that these posts could not be filled by UK workers.⁴

a) Domestic Skills Gaps

The creative industries rely on international workers to fill roles where there are major skills gaps domestically. Skills gaps are being felt across the creative industries, in particular in roles that require a mix of creative and technical skills. In the Federation's 2017 survey, 57% told us that they were facing skills shortages. Of these, 78% told us that they were not confident these would be solved in the next five years.⁵

The difficulties facing the sector stem from a mix of inadequate provision in schools, an underdeveloped technical education system and a lack of awareness about careers that the sector has to offer. The number of people studying creative subjects is declining and has been exacerbated due to the lack of importance that government has placed on creative skills and subjects:

- The number of students taking GCSE design and technology dropped by 41% between 2007/8 and 2014/15.⁶
- 2016 saw the lowest number of entries for arts subjects in England and Wales for a decade.⁷
- Entries for GCSEs in creative subjects fell by 46,000 in 2016 against a rise in subjects promoted as "core" by the government's EBacc attainment measure.⁸ Entries for arts subjects in Scotland also declined.

Creative subjects and vocational training are key to the future of the UK economy and can provide people with the skills to thrive in a world more influenced by automation and artificial intelligence. As noted by Nesta and Pearson, "creative, digital, design and engineering occupations have bright outlooks and are strongly complemented by digital technology".⁹

b) Global Skills Gaps

The creative industries are incredibly innovative and use new technologies and techniques that are constantly evolving and blend a variety of skills. For example, video games developers use increasingly sophisticated artificial intelligence, fashion houses employ highly specialist craftspeople to develop unique pieces, and new materials are used by architects on construction projects.

⁴ "Global Talent Report" Creative Industries Federation, 2018, p.14

⁵ "Global Talent Report" Creative Industries Federation, 2018, p.22

⁶ Pooley, Emma, and Andrew Rowell. "Studying Craft 16: Trends in Craft Education and Training." Crafts Council; TBR, October 2016.

⁷ Johnes, Rebecca. "Entries to Arts Subjects at Key Stage 4." Education Policy Institute, September 2017.

⁸ Hill, Liz. "Arts in Schools Plummets, New Figures Show." ArtsProfessional, July, 2016 n.d.

⁹ Bakhshi, Hasan, Michael Osborne, Jonathan Downing, and Philippe Schneider. "The Future of Skills - Employment in 2030," September 2017.

The pace at which technology disrupts the creative sectors means it is not possible for industry to continuously upskill their workforce. Creative industries worldwide are therefore competing for access to a small pool of specialised talent and freelancers. Creative Carbon Scotland, for example, work on environmental sustainability in the arts and cultural sector where, for certain roles, only a handful of workers have the skills they require.

While domestic workers can be trained in foreign languages and cultures to an extent, international workers bring lived experience of overseas markets and contacts with key stakeholders on the ground. Penguin Random House for example sell international rights as a means of generating millions of pounds of profits and boosting both UK success and the profile of newer authors. These sales can only be effectively delivered by an international workforce with a sensitivity to and an ability to connect in a unique way with their cultures.

Numerous studies have shown that cultural diversity gives businesses access to a broader range of skill sets, ideas and experiences and these businesses perform better.¹⁰ Furthermore, the UK workforce itself benefits from increased interaction with the best and brightest from across the world. This helps the domestic workforce develop new skills and practices. Our ability to bring in international staff has helped secure inward investment from multinational companies, who use the UK as a base of operations for work around the world.

An immigration system that tackles skill shortages

It is vital that the UK's immigration system gives the creative industries access to world leading talent with relative ease, and that Britain retains its reputation as an attractive place to live and work. This is essential to the continued growth of the sector and if we are to reach the Creative Industries Sector Deal target of increasing the value of creative industries' exports by 50% by 2023.

a) Shortage occupation list

There are currently around 22 creative industries job titles on the shortage occupation list, which cover dancers, musicians, animators and graphic designers. However, the shortages within the creative industries cut across many other job titles and there is a need to ensure that these are properly represented on the list. Our survey revealed 41 roles that creative organisations found to be in shortage but only 17 of these, 41%, are on the shortage occupation list. Moreover, of the 9 sub-sectors that indicated that they were experiencing shortages, 5 of them had no representation on the list at all.

To ensure the shortage occupation list is able to capture skills shortages within the creative industries, the first step is to update and regularly review the standard occupational classification codes (SOCs). A variety of roles across the creative industries, from art/technical operators such as highly skilled audio engineers, to architects with specific specialisms, circus performers, and senior teaching staff in film education, are excluded or do not fit neatly into the SOC codes. Certain roles are often confused, such as "riggers" in VFX and animation which are often confused with riggers in construction. These roles should be named more clearly.

Furthermore, as mentioned, the creative industries are a highly innovative sector, employing technologies and practices that are constantly evolving. The SOC codes have not kept up with these changes and new roles such as player interaction specialists in the video games sector are not included.

¹⁰ Nathan, Max. "Cultural Diversity, Innovation, and Entrepreneurship: Firm-Level Evidence from London." *Economic Geography* 89, no. 4 (2013): 367–94; Hunt, Vivian, Dennis Layton, and Sara Prince. "Diversity Matters." McKinsey, 2015.

The shortage occupation list should then be more accurately updated to reflect skills shortages in the sector. Job titles such as player interaction specialists, senior designers in the brand design sector, and senior teaching staff in film education - alongside job titles below in Annex 1 and put forward by creative industries trade bodies and organisations in response to this consultation - should be covered in the list. Roles should only be removed after thorough consultation and assessment of the workforce.

The government should commission biannual reviews of the shortage occupation list, in consultation with the sector, to ensure skills shortages are identified and addressed as quickly as possible. This is necessary to ensure that we are able to register and react to emerging skills gaps as quickly as possible to capture the most exciting, interdisciplinary roles that are emerging in the sector.

Currently, creative enterprises facing shortages are facing significant delays and costs in order to bring in international workers. These difficulties lead to further knock-on effects on the ability of an organisation to complete work and therefore on their ability to grow.

Ffilm Cymru Wales for example has seen delays and alterations to production schedules due to difficulties in recruiting key roles not included on the shortage occupation list such as photography directors, production accountants and special effects workers. Missing roles on the shortage occupation list can also have a greater impact than on just those occupations as there is an additional knock-on effect on all other professions they interact with to enable large and interconnected projects to happen.

b) Salary Threshold

The salary thresholds apply to all hires under Tier 2, including those on the shortage occupation list (with an exemption for those applying for indefinite leave to remain). However, salary thresholds have proven problematic and have exacerbated the current skills shortages faced by the sector. In the Federation's recent survey, around 51% of respondents stated that they are in favour of abolishing the salary threshold of £30,000, and 26% were in favour of significant changes to the threshold.

In the creative industries, high skill levels are not always commensurate with high levels of pay. Many roles crucial to creative enterprises typically pay less than £30,000. Key roles within the creative industries do not meet the threshold such as: lead paint and roto artists in visual effects (average¹¹ salary £25,000), arts festival producers (£24-28,000), assistant film commissioners (£23,000), acrobatic performers (£23,000) and production sound engineers (£26,000).

The salary threshold of £30,000 means that international workers brought in by the creative industries have to be paid at a rate out of line with average industry levels. This issue was recognised by the Migration Advisory Committee (MAC) in 2013 which recommended that government make special provisions for the creative industries around minimum salary and qualification requirements. While five codes of practice were developed to recognise the sector's unique educational requirements for a small selection of specialised roles (such as dancers and orchestral musicians), no such corresponding provision was made on salaries.

¹¹ Currently appropriate rates are based on the 25th percentile (experienced hires) and the 10th percentile (entry level).

The minimum salary threshold is also a problem for creative workers applying for indefinite leave to remain. Highly-skilled staff - from graphic designers to pattern cutters - will not earn £35,000 after five years in a company, as the rules require. Creative enterprise cannot make a stable investment in international workers over a five year period if there is no certainty that they will be able to stay long-term.

The skills shortages creative enterprises face will only be amplified if the salary threshold applies to all international hires, including EEA workers. 81% of respondents to the Federation's recent survey said that they would face challenges if they were unable to hire high skilled EEA workers on salaries below £30,000. This will place a huge burden on creative enterprises and deny them access to the best and brightest from Europe.

In our recent survey, a representative from the music sector highlighted that extending the salary threshold will hit small enterprises in particular. It "will decimate employment of ex-UK talent across [the music] sector and particularly for SMEs, whose employees are often freelance and whose margins don't allow for salaries equivalent to those offered by the finance and tech sectors." This puts smaller companies at a disadvantage when recruiting international talent in comparison to larger businesses with greater financial resources.

If the government does not intend to exempt EEA or creative workers, the salary threshold for all international hires should be lowered.¹² Alternatively, more flexibility could be introduced by a simple change to the language in the immigration rules. To bring in international workers, employers are currently required to pay the salary threshold of £30,000 per year or the appropriate rate, "whichever is higher." If a creative enterprise wants to bring in a highly skilled worker on an industry average of £23,000, they therefore have to pay them £30,000.

This could be addressed by changing the language to £30,000 per year or the appropriate rate, "whichever is lower." This would allow employers to bring in the highly skilled worker on £23,000. This should also be applied to the salary thresholds of £35,000 for indefinite leave to remain and £20,800 for new entrants.

Appropriate rates in the SOC codes must also take account of the fact that salaries vary considerably at different levels of expertise. SOC codes should be divided to indicate junior, mid-level and senior positions and their corresponding appropriate rates. There should be industry involvement in determining these.

c) Immigration Skills Charge

The immigration skills charge should be scrapped. The combination of the immigration skills charge and health surcharge (which has just been doubled) means creative enterprises may end up paying an additional £7,000 per international worker over the course of five years before the worker can acquire permanent residency. The amount could reach £12,000 if the government acts on its plan to double the immigration skills charge. All of this is in addition to the underlying visa application fees and ancillary charges, the costs of holding a sponsorship licence and the staff overhead to process applications and ensure compliance.

Respondents to our recent survey indicated that the sum total of their charges reached an average of nearly £4,000 per each affected employee hired. A typical breakdown of costs can be seen through an SME

¹² There is consensus across the board to lower the threshold. London First has proposed lowering it to £20,115 in line with the London living wage. However, the threshold should take into account regional differences to ensure it works for industry UK-wide.

respondent in the Music, Performing and Visual arts sector which for one hire paid £1,820 for the immigration skills charge and £3,285 for their sponsorship licence charge, lawyer's fees and advertising necessary to meet the resident labour market test.

Government has stated that money raised by the immigration skills charge will be invested in skills training. It is yet to provide any details of how this money will be invested, or where money levied to date has been spent. This was recognised by the MAC in their recent report on EEA migration which described the immigration skills charge as 'disliked by employers especially as the 'skills' part of the name is regarded as misleading, there being no clear route by which the revenue raised is directed towards training: it would more accurately be described simply as the 'Immigration Charge'.¹³ The charge on the contrary is eating into creative enterprises budgets for training and upskilling their staff.

The sector is primarily composed of SMEs who already face resource challenges. 89% of creative enterprises employ between 1-4 people, with just 1% employing more than 50. The charges and administration within the current immigration system therefore particularly impact the creative industries more than other sectors and are a risk to their future growth.

The significant skills gaps in the creative industries mean that creative enterprises often have no alternative if they are to secure essential workers. It is unfair to penalise companies that are hiring internationally for roles where government has already recognised a lack of adequately trained domestic workers and/or where international workers' expertise are necessary for the roles. Those roles on the shortage occupation list therefore, at least, ought to be exempt from the immigration skills charge and other surcharges which impede access to necessary international talent.

The charge also fails to recognise that international recruitment helps to develop the domestic workforce by bringing workers into contact with the best in their field, who bring with them diverse new skill sets and international insights.

Currently, the impact of the immigration system on filling employment shortages is to an extent mitigated by the UK being an EU member state with the benefits of free movement. However, the government has said the immigration skills charge will remain in place in a system with no preferential treatment for EEA citizens. This will introduce huge costs for creative enterprises and exacerbate skills shortages. One respondent from the Music, Performing and Visual Arts sector in our recent survey stated "I would not be able to employ anyone and would probably be forced to leave [the UK]."

Existing industry-led initiatives

Many creative enterprises and organisations have already put in place initiatives to tackle domestic skill shortages. Prominent examples include the British Film Institute's Future Film Skills Programme¹⁴ and the NextGen Skills Academy¹⁵ which are working to bring more people into our industry and to train them for successful careers. Similarly, industry non-profit social enterprises and charities, such as Creative Access¹⁶ and

¹³ "EEA migration in the UK: Final report", Migration Advisory Committee (2018) p.114

¹⁴ "Future Film Skills Programme: Funding Guidelines", British Film Institute (2017), p.2-5

¹⁵ "About us", NextGen Skills Academy, <https://www.nextgenskillsacademy.com/about-us>

¹⁶ "About us", Creative Access, <https://creativeaccess.org.uk/about-us/>

The Mighty Creatives,¹⁷ have done significant work in improving access to relevant education and employment opportunities, increasing the pool of talent available to the sector.

Sector bodies have also played a key role in working to improve the uptake of essential roles in the creative industries. The Creative Industries Federation, ScreenSkills and Creative & Cultural Skills - with support from government - have recently launched an industry-led Creative Careers Programme. £2 million of grant funding has been made available by the Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport to kick-start the programme through to March 2020, with industry providing in-kind commitments and ensuring its sustainability long beyond this time.¹⁸

The overarching objective of the programme is to cultivate a workforce that is fit for the future by driving a stronger and more diverse supply of talent into the creative industries and wider creative economy. It aims to achieve this by helping young people and their influencers to understand the range of opportunities open to them across the creative economy, and the skills and qualifications they need to succeed when they leave school. It also aims to equip employers to diversify their workforce and plug skills shortages by developing the most urgently needed apprenticeship standards.

All of these initiatives though will take time to have an impact on domestic skill levels in the UK and therefore current industry initiatives cannot justify a reduction in government support. It is also important to remember that even if UK educational and training opportunities are improved there will always be a need for the UK to access global talent given the technological pace of change within the sector and the benefits that interaction with the brightest and best bring to UK workers.

¹⁷ “What we do”, The Mighty Creatives, <https://www.themightycreatives.com/about-us/what-we-do>

¹⁸ “An Update on the Creative Careers Programme”, Creative Industries Federation, December 2018

ANNEX 1: Overview of survey results

The Federation recently published a survey which ran from 6 December 2018 to 2 January 2019. The survey received 103 responses from stakeholders from across the creative industries and the UK. The survey was open to both members and non-members of the Federation.

Headline Stats

- Around 67% of respondents said that they currently experience difficulties recruiting for certain roles, compared to 21% who said they face no challenges and 12% unsure.
- 81% of respondents said that they would face challenges if they were unable to hire high skilled EEA permanent workers on salaries below £30,000, whilst just 6% said they would face no challenges.
- Around 51% of respondents stated that they are in favour of abolishing the Tier 2 salary threshold of £30,000, whilst 26% were in favour of significant changes to the threshold. Around 4% were in favour of maintaining it with no changes.
- Around 73% of those surveyed said that they were experiencing difficulties with the current sponsorship system. 60% of the reasons given as to why organisations were struggling with the system related to both the cost and time of obtaining a sponsorship licence.
- Around 54% of respondents were in favour of removing the resident labour market test and no one surveyed was clearly in favour of retaining it (the remainder of respondents said that they were unsure).
- Two-thirds of respondents agreed that employees on Tier 2 visas face challenges when moving between different employers with no one disagreeing and the remaining third being unsure.

1. Characteristics of respondents

- Almost every DCMS recognised creative industries sub-sector responded to the survey. The majority of respondents were from the music, performing and visual arts sector.
 - 5.9% - Advertising and Marketing
 - 4.4% - Crafts
 - 4.4% - Design (Product, Graphic, Fashion)
 - 10.3% - Film, TV, Video, Radio and Photography
 - 1.5% - IT, Software and Computer Services ('Creative Tech')
 - 1.5% - Publishing
 - 8.8% - Museums, Gallery and Libraries
 - 57.3% - Music, performing and visual arts sector
 - 1.5% - Animation and visual effects
 - 4.4% - Video games

2. Characteristics of workforce

- The number of international permanent staff vary. Some respondents indicated they have 1 international worker, whilst others indicated that anywhere between 50-100% of their permanent staff are international.
- Respondents indicated that hiring these workers can cost between £1,500-10,000 when you take into consideration the immigration skills charge, health surcharge and additional costs.

3. Shortage occupation list

- Around 67% of respondents said that they currently experience difficulties recruiting for certain roles, compared to 21% who said they face no challenges and 12% unsure.
- These roles are highlighted in the table below. Only 17 of these, 41%, are on the shortage occupation list. Moreover, of the 9 sub-sectors that indicated that they were experiencing shortages, 5 of them had no representation of their roles at all on the list.

Sector	Job title
Music, Performing and Visual Arts	Company Dancer; Head of New Media Arts Development; Digital Communications Officer; Senior Musician, Composer, Songwriter, Label Manager, A&R, Music Supervisor / Licensing Manager, PA / EA Marketing, and Plugger.
Film, TV, Video, Radio and Photography	Line Producer; Production Co-ordinator; Production Accountant; Director of Photography; Animator (e.g. composers, background illustrators); Special Effects; International Sales & Rights
Animation and visual effects	Animator; Videographer; Modeller; Artist; 2D Animator; 2D Designer/Asset Creator; 2D Rigger
Museums, Gallery and Libraries	Communications Manager; Senior Development Manager (Salary: £50,000, degree required); Administration Manager (Salary: £35,000, degree required) and Operation Assistant (salary: £21,500)
Crafts	Events and hospitality related roles (e.g. employed by the Goldsmith's Centre)
Design (Product, Graphic, Fashion)	Generally all roles are difficult to fill in design agencies. Specific roles include: Web Developer; Designer Project Manager (Graphic design in shortage occupation list only covers film, television and video games sub-sectors).
Advertising and Marketing	Designer (all levels)
Video Games	Programmer; Designer; Production Lead; Technical Artist; Game Director; Marketing Specialist with territory knowledge; Player Interaction Specialist
Film Education	Specialist teaching staff in film education (Can pay anything over £30k. Requires industry and education experience, preferably with MA qualification).

4. Salary threshold

- Around 51% of respondents stated that they are in favour of abolishing the Tier 2 salary threshold of £30,000, whilst 26% were in favour of significant changes to the threshold. Around 4% were in favour of maintaining it with no changes.
- Around 39% of respondents said that they currently face challenges hiring international staff, compared to 33% who do not. However, 81% of respondents said that they would face challenges if they were unable to hire high skilled EEA workers on salaries below £30,000, whilst just 6% said they would face no challenges.

- Around 32% of respondents said that over 75% of their international staff earn under £30,000. 20% of respondents said that this applies to less than 10% of their international staff whilst 35% were unsure.
- Respondents identified the following highly skilled roles which do not command a salary of £30,000. Many of these are identical to those in the table above which face shortages.

Sector	Job title	
Music, Performing and Visual Arts	<p>Acrobatic Performer Salary: equivalent of £23,000 Expected to have qualified from a performance school, have at least two years of experience and crucially skills such as tumbling or handstands which are not typical in the general population.</p> <p>Dancer; Performer Salary: £6000 (project-based) 12 years of professional training at top world conservatoire/university, 5 years of national and international work experience, plus about 4 years alongside studies.</p>	<p>Company Dancer Salary: £21,000 An extraordinary natural performance style and/or at least 2 years of professional dance experience, as well as high motivation, strong teaching and communications skills, and a commitment to fully participate in the extensive programme of ambassadorial education work worldwide. Degree level or higher; higher qualification below degree or vocational training.</p> <p>Artist Salary: £10,000 PhD, MA</p>
	<p>Head of Youth Circus Salary: £24,000 At least a couple of years experience as a qualified teacher</p> <p>Head of New Media Arts Development Salary: £28,335 Significant experience in developing new media arts programmes</p>	<p>Producer Salary: £24-28,000 Extensive experience making and facilitating work with international artists. Often a graduate degree is required.</p> <p>Choreographer Salary: £26,000 10 years of vocational training plus 10 years of professional experience</p>
	<p>Technical Manager Salary: £25-28,000 Degree or relevant training, significant experience of technical management.</p> <p>Programme Manager Salary: £29,535 Significant experience of engaging communities in arts activity</p> <p>Project Manager Salary: £28,000 More than three years' experience and a graduate degree</p>	<p>Digital Marketing Manager Salary: £25,000 Clear understanding of online developments. Experience with HTML and JAVA is a plus. Must keep up to date with new online marketing and advertising possibilities. Preferably 3-5 years prior work experience.</p> <p>Communications Manager Salary: £25,000 Degree or equivalent, 3 years experience</p> <p>Customer Relations Manager Salary: £28,335 Significant experience of team management and customer service in an arts venue.</p>

	<p>Marketing Manager Salary: £28,000</p> <p>Administrator Salary: £21,000 Secondary education plus 3 years experience</p>	<p>Learning & Participation Manager Salary: £28,000</p>
	<p>Costumes & Wigs Technical Roles Salary: Below £30,000</p> <p>Sound Engineer Salary: £26,000 Professional qualifications and several years experience</p> <p>Researcher; Analyst Salary: Below £30,000</p>	<p>Digital Communications Officer Salary: £28,000 Three years or more professional experience, experience of managing development of a website, social media experience etc., developing and implementing communications strategy. Degree level.</p>
	<p>Label Manager Salary: £25-30,000 A good understanding of the international music market, high attention to detail and able to operate with flexible deadlines. Work experience: 3-5 years.</p> <p>Artist Manager Salary: £25-30,000 Good understanding of the international music market. Work experience: 2-3 years</p>	<p>Senior Musician, Composer, Songwriters, A&R, Music Supervisors / Licensing Managers, PAs / EAs Marketing, Pluggers Salary: Often below £30,000</p>
Animation and Visual Effects	<p>Composer; Junior Composer; Junior CG Artist; CG Artist; Videographer; Modeller, Artist, Retoucher Salary: Often below £30,000</p> <p>Most 2D animator roles such as 2D Animator; 2D Designer/Asset Creator; 2D Rigger Salary: £25,000 Prior experience on a 2D animation production required and 2D animation software skills essential. These are skilled staff with a number of years experience on animation productions.</p>	<p>Animators (eg composers, background illustrators) Salary: Often below £30,000 In most instances hires get made based on prior experience/film (or high end TV) credits over and above formal qualifications, although animators and accountants (MovieMagic) will have software specific training.</p>
Film, TV, Video, Radio and Photography	<p>Assistant Film Commissioner Salary: £23,000 Industry background and a degree</p>	<p>International Sales & Rights Salary: £25-28,000 Previous industry work experience, preferred international market, languages, rights including IP law, creative suite including photoshop, and degree qualification.</p>

	Development Executives; Marketing Manager; Training Coordinator; Bookkeeper (part-time) Salary: Often below £30,000	
Museums, Gallery and Libraries	<p>Senior Programme Manager Salary: £28,000</p> <p>Engagement Producer Salary: £26,000</p> <p>Events Manager Salary: £27,000</p> <p>Communications Manager Salary: £21-27,000 Degree often required and three or more years of experience.</p> <p>Facilities Manager Salary: £26,000</p> <p>Assistant Producer Salary: £21,000</p>	<p>Story Builder Salary: Often below £30,000 Specialist literature facilitators with knowledge, skills and experience of Early Years development.</p> <p>Curator: Archive Gallery Salary: £35,000 full time equivalent, but this is a part-time role, so earns less than £30,000. MA in curatorial studies.</p> <p>Curator: Community Programmes Salary: £27,580 full time equivalent. This is a part-time role. MA.</p> <p>Operation Assistants Salary: £21,500</p>
Crafts	<p>Events Sales Manager Salary: £29k Experienced in events and with a degree</p> <p>Events Sales Executive Salary: £25k Junior role requiring a degree</p>	<p>Events Duty Supervisor Salary: £19k Events undergraduate</p>
Advertising and Marketing	<p>Account Manager Salary: £28,000 Humanities/media degree, additional languages an advantage, and 3 plus years experience.</p> <p>Specialist Sales for Foreign Markets Salary: Often below £30,000</p>	<p>Designer, Artworker Salary: Often below £30,000</p> <p>Junior Designer Salary: £25,000 3 plus years industry experience and degree level education in design specific subject area.</p>
Video Games	Entry level Programmer; Artist; Animator; Designer; Player Interaction Specialist Salary: Often below £30,000	
Film Education	Visiting Director, Designer, Skills Teacher Salary: £2-4,000 These staff may be earning £30,000 or less across a range of jobs with RADA and elsewhere. Anything from 10 years professional experience upwards.	

Publishing	Designer Salary: £28,000	Picture Editor Salary: £22,000
	Managing Editor Salary: £25,000	

5. Other

- Around 73% of those surveyed said that they were experiencing difficulties with the current sponsorship system. 60% of the reasons given as to why organisations were struggling with the system related to both the cost and time of obtaining a sponsorship licence.
- Around 54% of respondents were in favour of removing the resident labour market test and no one surveyed was clearly in favour of retaining it (the remainder of respondents said that they were unsure).
- Two-thirds of respondents agreed that employees on Tier 2 visas face challenges when moving between different employers with no one disagreeing and the remaining third being unsure.

ANNEX 2: Additional data collected

Additional data reported by Federation members indicated the following positions to be in shortage, some of which were also indicated in our survey results above. The shortage occupation list should retain or add all of these positions alongside job titles identified by creative industries trade bodies and organisations in response to this consultation.

Sector	Job title
Advertising	Roles relating to IT, Creatives/Designers and Management
Animation and Visual Effects	IT Business Analysts, Architects and Designers (systems engineer); Programmers and Software Development Professionals (Software Developer, Shader Writer, Games Designer); Artists (Animator); Arts Officers, Producers and Directors (2D Supervisor, 3D Supervisor, CG Supervisor, Producer, Production Manager, Technical Director, VFX Supervisor); Graphic Designers (Compositing Artist, Matte Painter, Modeller, Rigger, Stereo Artist (for 3D content), Texture Artist) Systems Administrator (IT for creative businesses is significantly different to IT for corporates); Production Co-ordinator; Technical Artist; Concept Artist; Storyboard Artist; Layout Artist; Pre-visualisation Artist; Creative Director; VFX Editor
Architecture	Specialist Architects e.g. Building Information Management (BIM) Co-ordinators
Music	All Orchestral Musicians including Tutti (the non-senior positions within orchestras that are currently not included under the scope of orchestral musicians included on the shortage occupation list).
Video Games	Systems Engineer; Software developer; Shader writer; Game designers; Animator; 2D Supervisor; 3D Supervisor; Computer Supervisor; Producer; Production Manager; Technical Director; Compositing Artist; Matte Painter; Modeller; Rigger; Stereo Artist; Texture artist; VFX Artist; Feature Designer; Level Designer; Graphics Programmer; Principal Programmer; Principal Designer; Network Programmer; Tools Programmer; Principal Animator; Senior Environment Artist; Senior Animator; Data Analyst; Junior Data Analyst; Client-Side Engineer; Client-Side Developer; Server-Side Engineer; Server-Side Developer; Producer; Senior Software Engineers